

**ASME V&V 20-2009**

# **Standard for Verification and Validation in Computational Fluid Dynamics and Heat Transfer**

---

AN AMERICAN NATIONAL STANDARD



# CONTENTS

Foreword	vi
Committee Roster	viii
Correspondence With the V&V 20 Committee	ix
<b>Section 1 Introduction to Validation Methodology</b>	<b>1</b>
1-1 General	1
1-2 Objective and Scope	1
1-3 Errors and Uncertainties	1
1-4 Example for Validation Nomenclature and Approach	2
1-5 Validation Approach	3
1-6 Overview of Subsequent Sections	5
1-7 References	5
<b>Section 2 Code Verification and Solution Verification</b>	<b>7</b>
2-1 General	7
2-2 Introduction	7
2-3 Code Verification	7
2-4 Solution Verification	11
2-5 Special Considerations	16
2-6 Final Comment	17
2-7 References	17
<b>Section 3 Effect of Input Parameter Uncertainty on Simulation Uncertainty</b>	<b>19</b>
3-1 Introduction	19
3-2 Sensitivity Coefficient (Local) Method for Parameter Uncertainty Propagation	19
3-3 Sampling (Global) Methods for Parameter Uncertainty Propagation	23
3-4 Importance Factors	25
3-5 Special Considerations	25
3-6 Final Comment on Parameter Uncertainty	26
3-7 References	26
<b>Section 4 Uncertainty of an Experimental Result</b>	<b>27</b>
4-1 Overview	27
4-2 Experimental Uncertainty Analysis	27
4-3 Uncertainty of Validation Experiment	28
4-4 Summary	28
4-5 References	28
<b>Section 5 Evaluation of Validation Uncertainty</b>	<b>30</b>
5-1 Overview	30
5-2 Estimating $u_{\text{val}}$ When the Experimental Value, $D$ , of the Validation Variable is Directly Measured (Case 1)	30
5-3 Estimating $u_{\text{val}}$ When the Experimental Value, $D$ , of the Validation Variable is Determined From a Data Reduction Equation (Cases 2 and 3)	31
5-4 Estimating $u_{\text{val}}$ When the Experimental Value, $D$ , of the Validation Variable is Determined From a Data Reduction Equation That Itself Is a Model (Case 4)	36
5-5 Assumptions and Issues	37
5-6 References	39
<b>Section 6 Interpretation of Validation Results</b>	<b>40</b>
6-1 Introduction	40
6-2 Interpretation of Validation Results Using $E$ and $u_{\text{val}}$ With No Assumptions Made About Error Distributions	40

6-3	Interpretation of Validation Results Using $E$ and $u_{\text{val}}$ With Assumptions Made About Error Distributions. . . . .	40
6-4	References . . . . .	41
<b>Section 7</b>	<b>Examples . . . . .</b>	<b>42</b>
7-1	Overview . . . . .	42
7-2	Code Verification Example . . . . .	42
7-3	Validation Example . . . . .	48
7-4	References . . . . .	65
<b>Figures</b>		
1-4-1	Schematic of Finned-Tube Assembly for Heat Transfer Example . . . . .	2
1-5-1	Schematic Showing Nomenclature for Validation Approach . . . . .	3
1-5-2	Overview of the Validation Process With Sources of Error in Ovals . . . . .	4
2-4-1	Sample Uncertainty Analysis: Explosive Detonation in a Fluid Filled Box . . . . .	15
3-2-1	Relative Error in Finite Difference Computation of $k\partial T/\partial k$ Using a Backwards Difference . . . . .	21
3-2-2	Estimated Uncertainty in Model Temperature Due to Uncertainty in $q$ , $k$ , and $\rho c_p$ . . . . .	22
3-3-1	Representative Probability Distribution Function for Thermal Conductivity . . . . .	23
3-3-2	Standard Deviation in Temperature at $z/L = 0$ and 1 for Constant Heat Flux Example Using 10 LHS Runs and Mean Value Method (With $u_x/X = 0.05$ ). . . . .	25
5-1-1	Schematic for Combustion Gas Flow Through a Duct With Wall Heat Flux Being the Validation Variable (Case 4). . . . .	30
5-2-1	Sensitivity Coefficient Propagation Approach for Estimating $u_{\text{val}}$ When the Validation Variable ( $T_o$ ) Is Directly Measured (Case 1) . . . . .	32
5-2-2	Monte Carlo Approach for Estimating $u_{\text{val}}$ When the Validation Variable ( $T_o$ ) Is Directly Measured (Case 1) . . . . .	32
5-3-1	Sensitivity Coefficient Propagation Approach for Estimating $u_{\text{val}}$ When the Validation Variable Is Defined by a Data Reduction Equation That Combines Variables Measured in the Experiment (Case 2) . . . . .	34
5-3-2	Monte Carlo Approach for Estimating $u_{\text{val}}$ When the Validation Variable Is Defined by a Data Reduction Equation That Combines Variables Measured in the Experiment (Case 2) . . . . .	34
5-3-3	Sensitivity Coefficient Propagation Approach for Estimating $u_{\text{val}}$ When the Validation Variable Is Defined by a Data Reduction Equation That Combines Variables Measured in the Experiment and Two Measured Variables Share an Identical Error Source (Case 3) . . . . .	35
5-3-4	Monte Carlo Propagation Approach for Estimating $u_{\text{val}}$ When the Validation Variable Is Defined by a Data Reduction Equation That Combines Variables Measured in the Experiment and Two Measured Variables Share an Identical Error Source (Case 3) . . . . .	36
5-4-1	Sensitivity Coefficient Propagation Approach for Estimating $u_{\text{val}}$ When the Validation Variable Is Defined by a Data Reduction Equation That Itself Is a Model (Case 4) . . . . .	37
5-4-2	Monte Carlo Propagation Approach for Estimating $u_{\text{val}}$ When the Validation Variable Is Defined by a Data Reduction Equation That Itself Is a Model (Case 4) . . . . .	38
7-2-1	Problem Domain With $(x, y)$ Coordinates Shown for Domain Corners . . . . .	42
7-2-2	Finite Element Meshes Used in the Code Verification Refinement Study. . . . .	44
7-2-3	Error as a Function of Characteristic Mesh Size . . . . .	47
7-3-1	Schematic of Fin-Tube Heat Exchanger Assembly . . . . .	48
7-3-2	Experimental Total Heat Transfer Rate and Its Standard Uncertainty, $u_D$ . . . . .	51
7-3-3	Heat Transfer Model for the Fin-Tube Assembly . . . . .	52
7-3-4	Mesh Refinement Study for Solution Verification . . . . .	55
7-3-5	Simulation Values of Total Heat Transfer Rate and Its Uncertainty, $u_{\text{input}}$ . . . . .	57
7-3-6	LHS Samples of Simulated and Experimental Values of Total Heat Transfer Rate . . . . .	60
7-3-7	Interval for $\delta_{\text{model}} (E \pm 2u_{\text{val}})$ Assuming a Gaussian Distribution for the Errors and 95% Probability. . . . .	61
7-3-8	Interval for $\delta_{\text{model}} (E \pm 2u_{\text{val}})$ Assuming a Gaussian Distribution for the Errors and 95% Probability for the Model With Contact Conductance at the Fin/Tube Interface . . . . .	65

**Tables**

2-4-1	Sample Uncertainty Analysis: Backward Facing Step . . . . .	15
2-4-2	Sample Uncertainty Analysis: Explosive Detonation. . . . .	16
3-3-1	Matrix Representation of Number of LHS Samples ( $n_{LHS}$ ) and Number of Parameters ( $n_p$ ) . . . . .	24
3-3-2	LHS Samples for the Three Parameters $q$ , $k$ , and $C$ . . . . .	24
7-2-1	Parameter Values Used for the Code Verification Example . . . . .	45
7-2-2	Code Verification Results . . . . .	45
7-2-3	Error ( $E_h$ ) in the Code Simulation During Mesh Refinement . . . . .	46
7-2-4	Observed Order of Convergence ( $p^{obs}$ ) From Mesh Refinement . . . . .	47
7-3-1	Details of the Fin-Tube Assembly and Flow Conditions . . . . .	49
7-3-2	Measured Flow Conditions and Calculated Total Heat Transfer Rate. . . . .	50
7-3-3	Estimates of the Experimental Measurement Standard Uncertainties . . . . .	50
7-3-4	Sensitivity Coefficients for Average Conditions . . . . .	50
7-3-5	Experimental Values of Total Heat Transfer Rate and Its Standard Uncertainties. . . . .	51
7-3-6	Simulation Model Input Parameters and Standard Uncertainties . . . . .	53
7-3-7	Simulation Values of Total Heat Transfer Rate . . . . .	54
7-3-8	Solution Verification Results for Total Heat Transfer Rate . . . . .	54
7-3-9	Measures of the Numerical Error and Numerical Uncertainty for Total Heat Transfer Rate. . . . .	55
7-3-10	Partial Derivatives of the Total Heat Transfer Rate for the Simulation Model With Respect to Uncertain Model Inputs for the Average of Measured Experimental Conditions and Standard Uncertainty for the Inputs. . . . .	56
7-3-11	Simulation Values of Total Heat Transfer Rate and Its Standard Uncertainty From Input Parameter Uncertainty. . . . .	56
7-3-12	Parameters Included in Evaluating $u_{val}$ , Parameter Standard Uncertainty Estimates, and Parameter Sensitivity Coefficients . . . . .	58
7-3-13	Experimental and Simulation Values of Total Heat Transfer Rate and Associated Standard Uncertainties . . . . .	58
7-3-14	Parameter Standard Uncertainty and Example Latin Hypercube Samples . . . . .	59
7-3-15	LHS Samples for the Simulated and Experimental Values of the Total Heat Transfer Rate. . . . .	60
7-3-16	Comparison of Nominal Values and Standard Uncertainties Computed With the Propagation and LHS Approaches . . . . .	60
7-3-17	Simulation Values of the Total Heat Transfer Rate for the Model With Contact Conductance . . . . .	62
7-3-18	Simulation Values of the Total Heat Transfer Rate and the Standard Uncertainty for the Model With Contact Conductance . . . . .	63
7-3-19	Solution Verification Results for Total Heat Transfer Rate for the Model With Contact Conductance . . . . .	63
7-3-20	Measures of the Numerical Error and Numerical Uncertainty for Total Heat Transfer Rate for the Model With Contact Conductance. . . . .	63
7-3-21	Partial Derivatives of the Total Heat Transfer Rate for the Simulation Model With Respect to Uncertainty Model Inputs for Model With Contact Conductance for the Average Measured Conditions . . . . .	64
7-3-22	Parameters Included in Evaluating $u_{val}$ , Parameter Standard Uncertainty Estimates, and Parameter Sensitivity Coefficients for the Model With Contact Conductance. . . . .	64
7-3-23	Experimental and Simulation Values of Total Heat Transfer Rate and Associated Uncertainties. . . . .	65

**Mandatory Appendices**

I	Detailed Development of Simulation Equations for Example Problem . . . . .	67
II	Nomenclature . . . . .	70

**Nonmandatory Appendices**

A	Method of Manufactured Solutions for the Sample Problem . . . . .	72
B	Importance Factors . . . . .	78
C	Additional Topics. . . . .	82