STP-NU-010

REGULATORY SAFETY ISSUES IN THE STRUCTURAL DESIGN CRITERIA OF ASME SECTION III SUBSECTION NH

For Very High Temperatures for VHTR & Gen IV



ASME STANDARDS TECHNOLOGY, LLC

Date of Issuance: December 7, 2007

This report was prepared as an account of work sponsored by U.S. Department on Energy (DOE) and the ASME Standards Technology, LLC (ASME ST-LLC).

Neither ASME, ASME ST-LLC, O'Donnell Consulting Engineers, Inc. nor others involved in the preparation or review of this report, nor any of their respective employees, members, or persons acting on their behalf, makes any warranty, express or implied, or assumes any legal liability or responsibility for the accuracy, completeness or usefulness of any information, apparatus, product or process disclosed, or represents that its use would not infringe upon privately owned rights.

Reference in this report to any specific commercial product, process or service by trade name, trademark, manufacturer or otherwise does not necessarily constitute or imply its endorsement, recommendation or favoring by ASME ST-LLC or others involved in the preparation or review of this report, or any agency thereof. The views and opinions of the authors, contributors and reviewers of the report expressed in this report do not necessarily reflect those of ASME ST-LLC or others involved in the preparation or review of this report, or any agency, or any agency thereof.

ASME ST-LLC does not take any position with respect to the validity of any patent rights asserted in connection with any items mentioned in this document, and does not undertake to insure anyone utilizing a publication against liability for infringement of any applicable Letters Patent, nor assumes any such liability. Users of a publication are expressly advised that determination of the validity of any such patent rights, and the risk of infringement of such rights, is entirely their own responsibility.

Participation by federal agency representative(s) or person(s) affiliated with industry is not to be interpreted as government or industry endorsement of this publication.

ASME is the registered trademark of The American Society of Mechanical Engineers.

No part of this document may be reproduced in any form, in an electronic retrieval system or otherwise, without the prior written permission of the publisher.

ASME Standards Technology, LLC Three Park Avenue, New York, NY 10016-5990

ISBN No. 0-7918-3143-4

Copyright © 2007 by ASME Standards Technology, LLC All Rights Reserved

TABLE OF CONTENTS

FO	PREWORD	V	
AB	3STRACT	vi	
1	SUMMARY	1	
2	INTRODUCTION	4	
3	NRC AND ACRS SAFETY ISSUES IN LICENSING REVIEW OF CRBR	5	
-	3.1 Elevated-Temperature Design and Operating Licensing Conditions	5	
	3.2 Structural Integrity Evaluation Approach for Licensing	5	
	3.2.1 Modes of Failure to Consider	5	
	3.2.2 Stress Categories	6	
	3.3 Structural Integrity Evaluation Methods	0	
	3.3.1 Simplified Analysis Method.	7	
	3.3.2 Detailed Analysis of Localized Areas	7	
	3.3.3 Models and Tests	/ 7	
	3.4.1 Perspective	7	
	3.4.2 NRC Licensing Review	8	
	3.4.3 NRC Safety Concerns	9	
	3.5 Summary of CRBR Licensing Review		
4	CURRENT NRC SAFETY ISSUES FOR STRUCTURAL DESIGN OF VHTR AND GEN I SYSTEMS	V 15	
	4.1 Materials and Design Bases in ASME Code Case N-47, NUREG/CR-5955, April 1993	15	
	4.2 Safety Evaluation of the Power Reactor Innovative Small-Module (PRISM) Liquid-Metal Reactor	16	
	4.3 Materials Engineering Research Needs for Advanced Reactors—ACRS, USNRC/RES and ORNL	16	
	4.4 Review and Assessment of Codes and Procedures for HTGR Components, NUREG/CR- 6816 June 2003 [20]	17	
	4.5 Materials Behavior in HTGR Environments, NUREG/CR-6824 July 2003 [21]	19	
	4.6 Design Features and Technology Uncertainties for the Next-Generation Nuclear Plant, INEEL/Ext-04-01816, June 30, 2004 [22]	20	
	4.7 NGNP Technical Issues Safety Research Needs, June 2003 [23]	20	
	4.8 Framework for Development of a Risk-Informed, Performance-Based Alternative to 10 CFR Part 50, NUREG-1860, July 2006 [24]	21	
5	HOW REGULATORY ISSUES ARE ADDRESSED BY CURRENT ASME CODE CASES AND SECTION III SUBSECTION NH "CLASS 1 COMPONENTS IN ELEVATED TEMPERATURE SERVICE"	22	
	5.1 Materials Creep Behavior, Creep Fatigue and Environmental Effects	22	
	5.2 The Structural Integrity of Welds	23	
	5.3 Development and Verification of Simplified Design Analysis Methods	23	
	5.4 Verification Testing	24	

6	MATERIALS MODELS DESIGN CRITERIA AND ANALYSIS METHODS NEEDED IN THE ASME CODE TO COVER REGULATOR ISSUES FOR VERY-HIGH-	
	TEMPERATURE SERVICE	25
	6.1 Material Creep Behavior, Creep Fatigue and Environmental Effects	25
	6.2 The Structural Integrity of Welds	25
	6.3 Development and Verification of Simplified Design Analysis Methods	25
	6.4 Verification Testing	26
AC	KNOWLEDGMENTS	27
AB	BREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS	28
RE	FERENCES	29
Ap	pendix A—NRC Licensing Review of CRBR—1983	31
Ap	pendix B—May 2, 2007 NRC Draft for Review	32

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1-NRC List of Elevated Tem	perature Structural Integrity Issues	33
Tuble I Hille Elst of Elevated Tell	perature structural integrity issues	

FOREWORD

This document is the result of work resulting from Cooperative Agreement DE-FC07-05ID14712 between the U.S. Department of Energy (DOE) and ASME Standards Technology, LLC (ASME ST-LLC) for the Generation IV (Gen IV) Reactor Materials Project. The objective of the project is to provide technical information necessary to update and expand appropriate ASME materials, construction, and design codes for application in future Gen IV nuclear reactor systems that operate at elevated temperatures. The scope of work is divided into specific areas that are tied to the Generation IV Reactors Integrated Materials Technology Program Plan. This report is the result of work performed under the regulatory safety area and is entitled "Regulatory Safety Issues in Structural Design Criteria of ASME Section III Subsection NH and for Very High Temperatures for VHTR & Gen IV."

ASME ST-LLC has introduced the results of the project into the ASME volunteer standards committees developing new code rules for Generation IV nuclear reactors. The project deliverables are expected to become vital references for the committees and serve as important technical bases for new rules. These new rules will be developed under ASME's voluntary consensus process, which requires balance of interest, openness, consensus and due process. Through the course of the project ASME ST-LLC has involved key stakeholders from industry and government to help ensure that the technical direction of the research supports the anticipated codes and standards needs. This directed approach and early stakeholder involvement is expected to result in consensus building that will ultimately expedite the standards development process as well as commercialization of the technology.

ASME has been involved in nuclear codes and standards since 1956. The Society created Section III of the Boiler and Pressure Vessel Code, which addresses nuclear reactor technology, in 1963. ASME Standards promote safety, reliability and component interchangeability in mechanical systems.

The American Society of Mechanical Engineers (ASME) is a not-for-profit professional organization promoting the art, science and practice of mechanical and multidisciplinary engineering and allied sciences. ASME develops codes and standards that enhance public safety, and provides lifelong learning and technical exchange opportunities benefiting the engineering and technology community. Visit www.asme.org.

The ASME Standards Technology, LLC (ASME ST-LLC) is a not-for-profit Limited Liability Company, with ASME as the sole member, formed to carry out work related to newly commercialized technology. The ASME ST-LLC mission includes meeting the needs of industry and government by providing new standards-related products and services, which advance the application of emerging and newly commercialized science and technology and providing the research and technology development needed to establish and maintain the technical relevance of codes and standards. Visit <u>www.stllc.asme.org</u> for more information.

ABSTRACT

This Report: 1) identifies the safety issues relevant to the ASME Boiler and Pressure Vessel Code, including Section II, Section VIII, Section III Subsection NH (Class 1 Components in Elevated Temperature Service) and Code Cases that must be resolved in order to support licensing of Generation IV Nuclear Reactors, particularly Very-High-Temperature Gas-Cooled Reactors (VHTRs); 2) describes how Subsection NH addresses these issues; and 3) identifies the needs for additional criteria to cover unresolved safety concerns for very-high-temperature service.

The report also contains a description of the high-temperature structural integrity safety concerns raised by the U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission (NRC) and the Advisory Committee on Reactor Safeguards (ACRS) and how these issues are addressed in Subsection NH of the ASME Code.